University of North Carolina at Greensboro
HIS 411C - Seminar in Historical Research and Writing
Popular Protest in Chinese History

Fall Semester 2020
MW 3:30-4:45pm
Online (Synchronous class)
Instructor: James A. Anderson
Telephone: (336) 334-5204
Office: MHRA 2135
E-mail: jamie_anderson@uncg.edu (This is the best way to contact me throughout the week.)
Course web site: http://www.uncg.edu/his/docs/Anderson_index.html

Office Hours: MW 10:00-10:50 a.m. (via Google Meet) or by appointment

Introduction:

This course will examine the nature of popular protest in Chinese history. Topics examined during the semester will include the role religion played as a source of social volatility in traditional Chinese culture and society, peasant revolutions, the May Fourth Movement, popular protest in the rise of nationalism and communism, and domestic political protest since the 1949 founding of the People’s Republic of China. Most importantly, students in this course will be responsible for individual research projects, for which they will locate and use historical source materials, written and oral, published and unpublished. Comparing and analyzing a variety of primary source materials, students will write their own histories of Chinese popular protest and in the end develop their skills in observing societies with different origins than their own.

Students taking this course should reach the following goals by the end of the semester:

- Construct persuasive written arguments with the use of primary source materials as supporting evidence.
- Utilize the latest methods of Web-based technology to communicate with fellow students.
- Understand better the effect the ancient past has had on the modern world.
- Exhibit self-motivation and self-expression by exploring and asking questions regarding historical topics beyond personal life experiences.

Course Requirements

I expect all students to attend and participate in all class meetings. Moreover, the completion of all written assignments is necessary for a passing grade. No “incompletes” will be given for this class. Please remember to plan ahead! Because this class is both Writing Intensive (WI) and Speaking Intensive (SI), I have incorporated opportunities for criticism and improvement following the first writing and speaking assignments. I will also require that all students establish e-mail accounts with Internet access. This course will occasionally involve interaction between the instructor and students outside of the lecture period. Please set up these accounts as soon as possible. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.
Grading (Undergraduates)

Research exercises 20% (average of grades for three assignments)
Historiographical essay (4-5 pages) 10%
Class presentations 20% (10% each)
Final paper (15-20 pages) 30%
Class participation 20%

Grading (Graduate students)

Final paper (25-30 pages) 50%
Historiographical essay (4-5 pages) 10%
Class presentations 20% (10% each)
Class participation 20%

Detailed Description of Graded Assignments

1. Research assignments

All undergraduate students will be required to complete a series of research exercises during the course of the semester. Each assignment must be completed by the assigned due date. Detailed descriptions of these assignments will be included at the end of this syllabus. Here is a summary list of these assignments:
   1. Project Description (Due September 9)
   2. Preliminary Bibliography (Due September 30)
   3. Critique of a Peer’s Paper (Due November 18)

2. Historiographical Essay

A historiographical essay is a critical overview of a variety of historical interpretations of an oftentimes narrowly focused topic. Such essays can take different forms, and we will discuss these forms during this course. All undergraduate students in this class will produce a 4-5 page historiographical essay, in which they will compare the main arguments of the 6-10 secondary sources they have located for their research paper.

3. Class presentations

All students will be required to give two presentations to the class during the semester. We will discuss the nature of these presentations later on in the course. All students enrolled in this class must attend a speaking workshop on September 14th.

4. Final Paper

All students will produce a research paper, based on both primary and secondary sources, by the
end of this semester. Paper topics may vary by individual interest and focus on specific events, but the general theme all students will examine will be the nature of popular protest in Chinese society from the Late Imperial era to the modern period. Please remember that the quality of your writing, particularly the clarity and persuasiveness of your argument, will factor into the final grading. Late papers will be penalized half a letter grade for each day beyond the original due date.

All students will supply briefly annotated bibliographies with their final essays. An annotated bibliography is a list of books, articles, and documents, in which each entry is followed by a brief description of the source itself. These descriptions, or annotations, are provided to advise the reader on the accuracy and usefulness of the materials you have cited in your bibliography.

Please remember that all students will submit preliminary versions of their annotated bibliographies in class on **October 10th**. For a better sense of what it entails to create an annotated bibliography, I urge everyone to visit the Cornell University Library's web site at [https://www.library.cornell.edu/research/citation/tutorial](https://www.library.cornell.edu/research/citation/tutorial). This page contains a very good overview of the process. The Cornell Library’s tutorial page, titled “Skill Guides: How to Find Specific Resources,” is filled with other useful information. This page may be found at [https://olinuris.library.cornell.edu/services/research/guides/skill](https://olinuris.library.cornell.edu/services/research/guides/skill).

### 5. Class Participation

Discussion and the exchange of ideas are very important components of this course. Everyone will be required to participate, and you should feel free to ask questions in every class. Each student will come to class having read the texts and prepared to discuss them. I will not hesitate to call on all students to participate. However, you should feel free to speak with me before class if you find it difficult to speak in a public setting. In that case, you may submit your questions before each class in writing.

**Note:** I ask that all students bring to class a one-page summary and two discussion questions for each chapter from the texts that we will discuss during the first weeks of the semester. I will collect these questions at the beginning of class.

### 6. Web Site contributions

I have created a Canvas web site for this classroom, which you and I will continue to expand as the semester progresses. Together we will discuss options for the expansion of the course web site during the first weeks of class. Students also can access course information, such as scheduled events (i.e. the syllabus you now hold in your hand), as well as links to web sites of interest to our class. I urge everyone to visit the site [Critical Thinking on the Web: A Directory of Quality Online Resources](http://austhink.com/critical/) before “surfing” through these on-line materials. Moreover, I will include additional materials on the course’s Canvas site. Please refer to the class Web site periodically for such materials.
**Required Reading**

UNC Greensboro University Libraries has available the following textbooks as an e-book with unlimited user access for HIS411C.

The library collaborated with the campus bookstore to be able to provide us an alternative option to access course materials in addition to purchasing print/electronic versions.


All other materials, if any, for this course will be available on Canvas.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WEEK'S TOPIC</th>
<th>READINGS AND DISCUSSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>19 August:</strong> Course “nuts and bolts” and topical introduction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>24-26 August:</strong> Historical Context of Chinese Popular Protest</td>
<td><strong>Required Readings:</strong> Rampolla, <em>A Pocket Guide to Writing History</em> (Chapters 1-2).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Skills Discussion:</strong> Choosing a research topic; finding sources</td>
<td><strong>Assigned Individual Readings:</strong> Perry, <em>Challenging the Mandate: Social Protest and State Power in China</em> (Chapters 1-5).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>31 August – 2 September:</strong> Historical Context of Chinese Popular Protest</td>
<td><strong>Required Reading:</strong> Rampolla, <em>A Pocket Guide to Writing History</em> (Chapter 5).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Skills Discussion:</strong> Library Workshop with Course Librarian. Researching a History Paper</td>
<td><strong>Assigned Individual Readings:</strong> Perry, <em>Challenging the Mandate: Social Protest and State Power in China</em> (Chapters 6-10).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Monday, September 7:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Labor Day holiday. Classes dismissed; offices closed.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>9 September:</strong> Popular Protest in “Greater China” (Taiwan and Hong Kong)</td>
<td><strong>Assigned Individual Readings:</strong> Huo, <em>Challenging Beijing's Mandate of Heaven: Taiwan's Sunflower Movement and Hong Kong's Umbrella Movement</em> (Introduction, Chapters 1-7, Conclusion, pp. 1-221)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>14 September:</strong> Speaking Center Workshop</td>
<td><strong>Research Assignment #1 due in class.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>18 September:</strong> class time reserved for Zoom/Google Meet student conferences to discuss preliminary bibliographies.</td>
<td><strong>SPEAKING CENTER WORKSHOP AND STUDENT CONFERENCES</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 21-23 September: Popular Unrest in China’s Borderlands

**Assigned Individual Readings:** Ben Hillman and Gray Tuttle (eds.) *Ethnic Conflict and Protest in Tibet and Xinjiang: Unrest in China's West.* (Intro., Chapters 1-9)

### 28-30 September: Class Presentations
**Skills Discussion:** Writing a History Paper

**Required Readings:** Rampolla, *A Pocket Guide to Writing History* (Chapter 4).

**Research Assignment #2 due in class.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WEEK'S TOPIC</th>
<th>READINGS AND DISCUSSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>5-7 October:</strong> The Great Proletarian Cultural Revolution, Film Discussion.</td>
<td><strong>Film:</strong> <em>Morning Sun</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>12-14 October:</strong> Spring 1989 Demonstrations, Film Discussion.</td>
<td><strong>Film:</strong> <em>The Gate of Heavenly Peace</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 14th</strong></td>
<td><strong>HISTORIOGRAPHICAL ESSAYS DUE IN CLASS</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>19-21 October:</strong> Memories of the Spring 1989 Demonstrations.</td>
<td><strong>Required Reading:</strong> Lim, Louisa. <em>The People's Republic of Amnesia</em> (pp. 1-226).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>26-28 October:</strong> Rural Protest and Labor Protest in China, Film Discussion.</td>
<td><strong>Required Readings:</strong> Rampolla, <em>A Pocket Guide to Writing History</em> (Chapters 6-7).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Skills Discussion:** Plagiarism and Documenting Sources | 1. Yang, “Political Process and Widespread Protests in China: the 2010 Labor Protest.” (Canvas)  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2-4 November:</th>
<th>WRITING WEEK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>MONDAY, NOVEMBER 9th</strong></td>
<td><strong>FIRST DRAFT OF PAPER DUE IN CLASS (two copies)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>9-11 November:</strong> China’s Environmental Movement, Citizen Activism Online, Film Discussion.</td>
<td><strong>Required Readings:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Grano and Zhang, “New Channels For Popular Participation in China: The Case of an Environmental Protection Movement In Nanjing.” (Canvas)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. King, Pan, Roberts, “How Censorship in China Allows Government Criticism but Silences Collective Expression” (Canvas)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Film:</strong> Under the Dome (Cai Jing)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>16-18 November:</strong> Class Presentations</td>
<td><strong>Class Presentations</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Research Assignment #3 due in class.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>23 November:</strong> Concluding Discussion and Review.</td>
<td><strong>Last Day of Class</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MONDAY, 23 NOVEMBER</strong></td>
<td><strong>GRADUATE RESEARCH PAPERS DUE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MONDAY, 23 NOVEMBER</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNDERGRADUATE RESEARCH PAPERS DUE</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Popular Protests in Chinese History (including mass movements with elements of individual protest)

1. Daze Village Uprising (209 BCE)*
2. Yellow Turban Rebellion (184-205)*
3. Five Pecks of Rice Rebellion (142-215)*
4. An Lushan Rebellion (756-763)*
5. Red Turban Rebellion (1351-1368)*
6. Li Zicheng's Rebellion (1642-1644)*
7. Revolt of the Three Feudatories (1672-1673)*
8. Guo Huaiyi Rebellion in Taiwan (1652)*
9. White Lotus Rebellion (1796- mid-19th century)
10. Taiping Rebellion (1851-1864)
11. Panthay Rebellion (1856–1873)
12. Nien Rebellion (1851-1868)
13. Dungan Revolt (1862-1877)
14. Boxer Rebellion (1900)
15. Xinhai Revolution (1911)
16. May Fourth Movement (1919)
17. May Thirtieth Movement (1925)
18. March 18 Massacre (1926)
19. Wushe Incident (1930)
20. December 9th Movement (1935)
21. 228 Incident (Taiwan) (1947)
22. Great Leap Forward (1958-60)
23. Uprising in Tibet (1959)
25. Democracy Wall Protests (1978)
30. Falun Gong Protest (1999-present day)
32. Dongzhou Protests 2005)
34. Online dissent
35. Labor Unrest
36. Violence in Public Protest in Chinese History

*Available sources require some effort to locate.
SELECTED RESEARCH SOURCES

ANTHOLOGIES

Asia for Educators (Columbia University) http://afe.easia.columbia.edu/index.html


de Crespigny, Rafe. To Establish Peace. Being the Chronicle of Later Han for the Years 189 to 220 AD as Recorded in Chapters 59 to 69 of the Zizhi tongjian of Sima Guang. ANU, 2004 online source. URL: http://dspace.anu.edu.au/html/1885/42048/peace1_index.html


Halsall, Paul. Internet East Asian History Sourcebook http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/eastasia/eastasiasbook.html


RESEARCH GUIDES AND BIBLIOGRAPHIES


Fessler, Susanna and Anthony Deblasi, *East Asian Research and Bibliographic Methods*, University at Albany, Department of East Asian Studies, URL: [http://www.albany.edu/cas/205/](http://www.albany.edu/cas/205/).


Littrup, Leif, *Studiematerialer om Kinas historie (Reference Works for Chinese Studies)*. University of Copenhagen, Department of History, URL: [http://littrup.blogs.ku.dk/links-til-undervisning-nyere-kinesisk-historie/](http://littrup.blogs.ku.dk/links-til-undervisning-nyere-kinesisk-historie/). (Text is in Danish, but individual links are in English.)


**PERIODICALS AND MISSIONARY RECORDS**

**Guides:**


**Sources:**

China [microform] New York: Division of Foreign Missions, NCCCUSA, Far Eastern Joint Office, China Committee Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 278; 1850-1869.


*Chinese Communist affairs, facts & features*. Taipei, Institute of International Relations (LC # D839 .C455)

*North China herald, and Supreme Court and consular gazette*. Shanghai, H. Shearman. Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 588; 1870-1900.


*People's daily online* [electronic resource]. Beijing: People's Daily Online, c2000-present. (WWW access from Library home page).


The Chinese recorder and missionary journal [microform]. Foochow: [s.n., 1868-1912] Jackson
Library Collection Microforms Film 3963; v.1-43, 19.


*Xinhua News Agency news bulletin.* Hong Kong: N.C.N. Ltd., 1985- present. (WWW access from Library home page).

**CONTEMPORARY NEWSPAPER AND MAGAZINE ARTICLES**

**Humanities & Social Sciences Abstracts** *(1907 to present)*
Coverage includes a wide range of interdisciplinary fields covered in a broad array of humanities and social sciences journals. There are some foreign language titles included prior to 1965; thereafter all titles are in English.

**New York Times Historical** *(1851-1999)*

**PAIS, Public Affairs Information System** Bulletin *(1915 to 1976)*
An index and bibliography of periodical articles, government publications, pamphlets and other material.

**Nineteenth Century British Library Newspapers** *(1800-1906)*
*Poole's* is one of the few indexes to British 19th century magazines and journals.

**Nineteenth Century US Newspapers**
*Poole's* is one of the few indexes to US 19th century magazines and journals.

**Reader's Guide Retrospective** *(1890-1982)*
The great index to U. S. (and some British) popular and general interest magazines of the Twentieth Century. It includes news magazines.

**Times Digital Archive** *(1785-1985)*
The *Times* of London. This database provides full-text images of each page of every issue of the *Times*.

**PERSONAL RECORDS AND MEMOIRS**
Search in *WorldCat* to identify works that UNCG may not have.

UNCG’s catalogues of e-books may be accessed [here](#).

Use [Early English Books Online](#) (EEBO) to identify traveler's accounts, reports of early exploration and reports of commercial and diplomatic relations in China published in Great Britain from 1475-1700. EEBO provides the full text of all titles.

**Church Missionary Society Archive** UNC (Davis Library): BV2500.A2 C4943 2000
The Church Missionary Society was a voluntary organization within the Church of England very active during the 19th century. China had become, beginning in 1844, the scene of extended CMS missionary activity. This set provides the letters, reports and papers associated with the main centers of CMS activity in South, West and Mid-China from 1834-1951. Within Microfilm 3309, go to Section 1: East Asia. Parts 10-19 cover the China Mission. The library has a printed guide to Parts 10-14 at Microform Reference BV2420.K43 Sect. 1 Pt. 10-14. Online guides to the parts of the collection covering China are listed below:

Part 10: China Mission, 1834-1914
Part 11: South China Mission, 1885-1934
Part 12: South China Mission, 1888-1934
Part 13: Chekiang Mission, 1885-1934
Part 14: Chekiang Mission, 1888-1934
Part 15: Western China Mission, 1897-1934
Part 16: Western China Mission, 1898-1934 and Fukien Mission covering 1900-1934
Part 17: Fukien Mission, 1911-1934

INDEXES TO GOVERNMENT SOURCES

Lexis-Nexis Congressional (1789-1969)
Indexes and identifies publications in the U.S. Serial Set (covering a wide range of topics related to specific legislative bills) and transcripts, testimony and evidence published in connection with Congressional hearings.

Foreign Broadcast Information Service daily report. China, FBIS daily report. (UNC Davis Library)

British Documents on Foreign Affairs: Reports and Documents from the Foreign Office Confidential Print (Duke- Perkins/Bostock Library)


The "Confidential Print" was a means of distributing diplomatic dispatches and other papers among government offices and agencies. These documents were generally reports of conditions or other matters in a country or area that observers, diplomatic, military, or civilian, thought important. All of these volumes have a table of contents with two or four word descriptions of the contents of each document.

Policing the Shanghai International Settlement, 1894-1945 (UNCG Archives Unbound Database)
Archives of the British-run municipal police force based in Shanghai’s former International Settlement that collected intelligence on political demonstrations, strikes, labor and social unrest, foreign and domestic subversive activities, and areas of dispute between the International Settlement and the Chinese government.

Documents the formation of the National Council for United States-China Trade and its role in the development of U.S.-China trade, and the Council’s library holdings relating to China’s trade and economy.

NOTE:
For these links and others, please visit the extremely useful Jackson Library website “Primary Sources for History: Archives and Online Collections,” maintained by librarian Lynda Kellam. The URL for this site is http://uncg.libguides.com/c.php?g=83554&p=535897
Appendix #1:

RESEARCH ASSIGNMENT #1: PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Due: Monday, September 19, in class

Assignment: On a sheet of paper, please type the following:
1. List your General Topic
2. Come up with a more specific Research Question (one sentence)
3. Write one (1) paragraph describing how you will answer this question
4. Append a list of one (1) primary and one (1) secondary source appropriate to your question.
Remember: all of these may well change in the next few weeks, but I’d like to see you try to sketch out a project as soon as possible.

Explanation of the Assignment:

1. General Topic:
Here I am asking for the research theme that first caught your eye. It is necessarily broad and descriptive.

2. Research Question:
Every historian begins her/his research with a question. The question helps to determine what you hope to uncover about your general topic. Your topic may be the Boxer Rebellion, but, as your professor will probably say to you, “What about the Boxer Rebellion?” In other words, what are you hoping to find out about your topic? It is important to have a research question (or perhaps one or two questions) before starting to do your research, or else you won’t know what to look for. Keep in mind, too, that it is very common for your question to change as you do research.

Keep in mind that there are several kinds of questions. The weakest questions require a description for their answer. Hence the question “What happened during the 1989 Tiananmen student demonstrations?” requires only that you find some texts about the students demonstrations and report back about them. In a way, such a question is more suited to journalism than it is to history. A second, more impressive question is one that requires analysis in answering it. This question, “What did the organizing tactics of Tiananmen demonstrators tell us about the prevalent political climate of Chinese society in 1989?” clearly requires you to do more than simply file a report. It requires you to think about the meaning of your topic to particular people in particular circumstances. This is the stuff of history.

Your research question is something that you should keep in the forefront of your mind for the entire semester. Constantly ask yourself “Why am I reading [whatever source]? What am I looking for?” Your research question will guide your reading appropriately.

---

1A special word of thanks to Professor Rick Barton for his assistance with the description of these assignments.
3. **Brief Description of the Project:**

Explain to me how you think you will pursue the research question you have just asked. You might discuss the kinds of sources you know (or hope) are available, and suggest some preliminary conclusions to your question. I only need a short paragraph here.

4. **A List of Two Sources:**

Please provide the bibliographic information for one primary source and one secondary source that you feel will be relevant to your topic. Should you be at a loss for sources, you might consult the bibliographies in our course materials, or you can speak with me. If you are having trouble keeping primary and secondary sources straight, please refer to the Library of Congress’s reference page (http://memory.loc.gov/ammem/ndlpedu/start/prim_sources.html) for this topic. The University of Washington (my alma mater) Suzallo Library’s web page “Using Primary Sources on the Web” (http://www.lib.washington.edu/subject/History/RUSA/) is also a very useful resource, although the documents available for topics in Chinese history are somewhat more limited than is the case in other areas of history.

**A tip on formulating Research Questions:** [taken from Gregory G. Colomb et al., *Craft of Research*, p. 44]

It may help in formulating your Research Question to work through the following sequence of questions.

1. Name your topic:
   
   “I am studying [topic]

2. Imply your question:

   “because I want to find out who/how/why ________________

3. State the rationale for the question and project:

   “in order to understand how/why ________________

**Words of Wisdom: Make Use of Note cards**

Make sure you are well stocked with note cards. Note cards are the researcher’s best friends. I find it best to extrapolate a concept or topic from the quotation you are making note of and record it in the upper left corner. Try to be consistent in coming up with categories. In the upper right, you might note either the type of source (primary v. secondary), or something more specific (like the genre of the source). The point of a note card is not to copy down lots of information - that would be wasting your time. The point of a note card is to construct a reminder to yourself of sources that contain evidence relating to a particular topic/concept. Then when you sit down to write your paper, you can collect all your note cards and set them out before you; as you set out to write each section, you can pull all the note cards pertaining to the section at hand. It will save you lots of time flipping through books or large, unorganized notebooks.
Appendix #2:

RESEARCH ASSIGNMENT #2: PRELIMINARY BIBLIOGRAPHY

DUE: Wednesday, September 30, in class

Assignment:
1. Prepare a preliminary bibliography for your topic. This bibliography should include 8-12 items, divided into the following categories (arrange works alphabetically within each section):
   I. Primary Sources: I expect to see 1-3 listed.
   II. Secondary Sources
      A. Books (I expect 4-6)
      B. Articles (I expect 2-4)

2. Provide a short annotation with each bibliographic entry that includes a 1-2 sentence rationale for that source (i.e., why you think it’ll be useful). You may place this comment immediately after the bibliographic entry.

Reminders:
A. Remember that primary sources are those written during the period you are studying; secondary sources are analyses by modern writers.
B. Books: often there will not be a book on your specific topic. Most scholars look for books to provide general or background information on the time period, region, or concept that interests them. You ought to be able to find books relatively easily by using any of the bibliographies listed on Bob Gaines’s History 511 Web-page or my own web page.
C. Articles: while it is generally harder for students to find articles than books, the reward is much greater. Articles, if well selected, often pertain more directly to the topic at hand and often provide much more specific interpretations against which you can shape your own argument. To find articles, use bibliographies and footnotes in books you have located, and/or the on-line databases, such as Expanded Academic Index, Web of Science, and JSTOR located on the library’s Electronic Databases page.
Appendix #3:

RESEARCH ASSIGNMENT #3: CRITIQUE OF PEER’S PAPER

DUE: Monday, November 18, in class

Assignment:
Write a short (no more than 2 page) critique of your colleague’s paper. Provide two (2) copies of that critique (one for your colleague, and one for me).

Components of the Critique: your critique should cover some or all of the following areas and/or questions.

1. Thesis/Argument: What is the argument of the paper? Is it clearly identified? Does the author maintain it throughout the paper? Does he/she successfully prove his/her point? How might the argument be strengthened?

2. Historiography: If appropriate, comment on how well the author situates his/her paper in the existing literature. That is, has the author examined the existing literature? How does his/her paper contribute to, modify, or reject the existing literature?

3. Evidence: Does the author possess sufficient evidence of sufficient quality to support his/her argument? Or does the evidence suggest something else? Does the author explain his/her evidence, or does he/she assume that you will see the importance of it? If the latter, how might he/she improve his/her discussion of the evidence?

4. Structure: Is the paper well organized? Could you follow the line of the argument? If not, how might the organization of the paper be improved? Remember that the ideal paper is like an assembly line, with each paragraph adding a bit more to the product until the conclusion, at which point you have a unified, coherent whole. Look for superfluous paragraphs and/or areas where expansion of the theme is necessary.

5. Style: Be careful and kind here. Everyone possesses an individual style. Still, you might well consider how the author’s style helps and/or hinders the paper.

6. Citations: Does the author cite sources in a consistent way? Do the citations (either footnotes or endnotes) provide the needed support for the argument? That is, are they useful or are they peripheral to the argument?

7. Grammar and Typos: does the paper contain grammar errors and/or misspelled words? You only need comment on this if there is a serious problem (anyone can leave a few typos, but it’s only worth commenting upon if they become so numerous as to detract from meaning).