# University of North Carolina at Greensboro HIS 511C - Seminar in Historical Research and Writing The Chinese City in the 20th century

Fall Semester 2008 M 3:30-6:20pm, MHRA 1211

Instructor: James A. Anderson Telephone: (336) 334-5209 Office: MHRA 2111

E-mail: **jamie\_anderson@uncg.edu** (This is the best way to contact me throughout the week.)

Course web site: <a href="http://www.uncg.edu/his/docs/Anderson">http://www.uncg.edu/his/docs/Anderson</a> index.html

Office Hours: TR 11:00-11:50 a.m., and by appointment

#### **Introduction:**

This course will examine the transformation of the modern Chinese city in the 20th century. Topics examined during the semester will include the role urban centers played as a source of political and intellectual movements in modern Chinese society, peasant revolutions, Chinese cities during the May Fourth Movement, urban crime and the policing of urban society, popular urban protest in the rise of nationalism and communism, and city life since the 1949 founding of the People's Republic of China. Most importantly, students in this course will be responsible for individual research projects, for which they will locate and use historical source materials, written and oral, published and unpublished. Comparing and analyzing a variety of primary source materials, students will write their own histories of Chinese urban centers and in the end develop their skills in observing societies with different origins than their own.

Students taking this course should reach the following goals by the end of the semester:

- □ Construct persuasive written arguments with the use of primary source materials as supporting evidence.
- ☐ Utilize the latest methods of Web-based technology to communicate with fellow students.
- Understand better the effect the ancient past has had on the modern world.
- ☐ Exhibit self-motivation and self-expression by exploring and asking questions regarding historical topics beyond personal life experiences.

# **Course Requirements**

I expect all students to attend and participate in <u>all</u> class meetings. Moreover, the completion of <u>all</u> written assignments is necessary for a passing grade. No "incompletes" will be given for this class. Please remember to plan ahead! Because this class is both Writing Intensive (WI) and Speaking Intensive (SI), I have incorporated opportunities for criticism and improvement following the first writing and speaking assignments. I will also require that all students establish e-mail accounts with Internet access. This course will occasionally involve interaction between the instructor and students outside of the lecture period. Please set up these accounts as soon as possible. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

# **Grading (Undergraduates)**

Research exercises 20% (average of grades for three assignments)

Historiographical essay (4-5 pages) 10%

Class presentations 20% (10% each)

Final paper (15-20 pages) 30% Class participation 20%

#### **Grading (Graduate students)**

Final paper (25-30 pages) 50% Historiographical essay (4-5 pages) 10%

Class presentations 20% (10% each)

Class participation 20%

# **Detailed Description of Graded Assignments**

#### 1. Research assignments

All undergraduate students will be required to complete a series of research exercises during the course of the semester. Each assignment <u>must</u> be completed by the assigned due date. Detailed descriptions of these assignments will be included at the end of this syllabus. Here is a summary list of these assignments:

- 1. Project Description (**Due September 22**) Research Assignment #1
- 2. Preliminary Bibliography, (**Due October 13**) Research Assignment #2
- 3. Critique of a Peer's Paper (**Due November 24**) Research Assignment #3

# 2. Historiographical Essay

A historiographical essay is a critical overview of a variety of historical interpretations of an oftentimes narrowly focused topic. Such essays can take different forms, and we will discuss these forms during this course. All undergraduate students in this class will produce a 4-5 page historiographical essay, in which they will compare the main arguments of the 6-10 secondary sources they have located for their research paper.

#### 3. Class presentations

All students will be required to give two presentations to the class during the semester. We will discuss the nature of these presentations later on in the course. All students enrolled in this class must attend a speaking workshop on September 22<sup>nd</sup>.

# 4. Final Paper

All students will produce a research paper, based on both primary and secondary sources, by the end of this semester. Paper topics may vary by individual interest and focus on specific events, but the general theme all students will examine will be the nature of Chinese urban society from the Late Imperial era to the modern period. Please remember that the quality of your writing, particularly the clarity and persuasiveness of your argument, will factor into the final grading. Late papers will be penalized half a letter grade for each day beyond the original due date.

All students will supply <u>briefly</u> annotated bibliographies with their final essays. An annotated bibliography is a list of books, articles, and documents, in which each entry is followed by a brief description of the source itself. These descriptions, or annotations, are provided to advise the reader on the accuracy and usefulness of the materials you have cited in your bibliography.

Please remember that all students will submit preliminary versions of their annotated bibliographies in class on September 13<sup>th</sup>. For a better sense of what it entails to create an annotated bibliography, I urge everyone to visit the Cornell University Library's web site at <a href="http://www.library.cornell.edu/olinuris/ref/research/skill28.htm">http://www.library.cornell.edu/olinuris/ref/research/skill28.htm</a>. This page contains a very good overview of the process. The Cornell Library's tutorial page, titled "Skill Guides: How to Find Specific Resources," is filled with other useful information. This page may be found at <a href="http://www.library.cornell.edu/olinuris/ref/tutorialsguides.html">http://www.library.cornell.edu/olinuris/ref/tutorialsguides.html</a>.

# 5. Class Participation

Discussion and the exchange of ideas are very important components of this course. Everyone will be required to participate, and you should feel free to ask questions in every class. Each student will come to class having read the texts and prepared to discuss them. I will not hesitate to call on all students to participate. However, you should feel free to speak with me before class, if you find it difficult to speak in a public setting. In that case, you may submit your questions before each class in writing.

**Note:** I ask that <u>all</u> students submit a 1-page summary and two discussion questions for each chapter from the texts that we will discuss during the first weeks of the semester. These submissions will be posted to Blackboard in the appropriate forum <u>by 11pm</u> the Sunday evening prior to the class meeting.

#### **Web Site contributions**

I have created a web site for this classroom, which you and I will continue to expand as the semester progresses. Together we will discuss options for the expansion of the course web site during the first weeks of class. Students also can access course information, such as scheduled events (i.e. the syllabus you now hold in your hand), as well as links to web sites of interest to our class. I urge everyone to visit the site *Critical Thinking on the Web: A Directory of Quality Online Resources* (http://www.philosophy.unimelb.edu.au/reason/critical/) before "surfing" through these on-line materials. Moreover, I may include additional materials on the library's Electronic Reserve list. Please refer to the class Web site periodically for such materials.

# **Required Reading**

- 1. Wakeman, Frederic E. *Policing Shanghai*, 1927-1937. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995. ISBN: 0520084888.
- 2. Dong, Madeleine Yue. *Republican Beijing The City and Its Histories*. Asia-Local studies/global themes, 8. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003. ISBN: 0585456321.
- 3. Carter, James Hugh. *Creating a Chinese Harbin: Nationalism in an International City, 1916-1932*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2002. ISBN: 0801439663.
- 4. Rampolla, Mary Lynn. *A Pocket Guide to Writing in History*. New York: Bedford/St. Martin's Press, 2006. 5th Edition. ISBN-13: 978-0312446734.

All other materials, if any, for this course will be available on electronic reserve.

READING SCHEDULE		
WEEK'S TOPIC	READINGS AND DISCUSSION	
August 25: Course "nuts and bolts" and topical introduction	No required reading.	
September 8: Approaches to Urban History in China  Skills Discussion: Choosing a research topic; finding sources	Required Readings: Man, "Urbanization and Historical Change," Johnson, "New Approaches," Goodman, "Politics of Representation" (e-reserve).  Rampolla, A Pocket Guide to Writing History (Chapters 1-2, Appendix B).	
September 15: Beijing Skills Discussion: Various styles of history writing	Required Readings: Dong, Republican Beijing: the City and its Histories (Introduction, Chapters 1-3).  Rampolla, A Pocket Guide to Writing History (Chapter 3).	
September 22: Beijing Skills Discussion: Writing a History Paper	Required Reading: Dong, Republican Beijing: the City and its Histories (Chapters 4-6)  Rampolla, A Pocket Guide to Writing History (Chapters 4-5).  SPEAKING CENTER WORKSHOP  Research Assignment #1 due in class.	
September 29: Library Workshop (5:00-6:20pm) and Student Conferences  Before 5:00pm: class time reserved for student conferences to discuss preliminary bibliographies.	LIBRARY WORKSHOP	

October 6: Beijing  Skills Discussion: Plagiarism and Documenting Sources	Required Reading: Dong, Republican Beijing: the City and its Histories (Chapters 7-9, Conclusion)  Rampolla, A Pocket Guide to Writing History (Chapters 6-7).  Alternate date for Speaking Workshop.
October 13: Class Presentations	Class Presentations  Research Assignment #2 due in class.
MONDAY, OCTOBER 13 <sup>th</sup>	HISTORIOGRAPHICAL ESSAYS DUE IN CLASS

# FALL BREAK: October 17, Friday - Instruction Ends for Fall Break 6:00 p.m October 22, Wednesday - Classes resume after Fall Break 8:00 a.m

WEEK'S TOPIC	READINGS AND DISCUSSION
October 27: Shanghai	Required Reading: Wakeman, Policing Shanghai (Chapters 1-9)
November 3: Shanghai	Required Reading: Wakeman, Policing Shanghai (Chapters 9-15, Conclusion)
November 10: Harbin	Required Reading: Carter, Creating a Chinese Harbin
November 17: Film Discussion	Film: Shower
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 17 <sup>th</sup>	FIRST DRAFT OF PAPER DUE IN CLASS ( <u>two</u> copies)
November 24: NO CLASS MEETING.	Research Assignment #3 due by Monday 11/24 at 3:30pm. Post to Blackboard.

NOVEMBER 27 <sup>th</sup> – NOVEMBER 30 <sup>th</sup>	THANKSGIVING HOLIDAY
December 1: NO CLASS MEETING. SCHEDULED CONFERENCES.	No Class Meeting Scheduled
December 8: Final Class Presentations	Class Presentations & Final Remarks Last Day of Class
MONDAY, DECEMBER 8 <sup>th</sup>	GRADUATE RESEARCH PAPERS DUE
MONDAY, DECEMBER 8 <sup>th</sup>	UNDERGRADUATE RESEARCH PAPERS DUE

# POSSIBLE RESEARCH TOPICS

Architecture
City Planning
Class Relations
Crime
Cultural and Intellectual Communities
Economic Development
Ethnic Relations
Family life
Imperial period urban centers
Labor Movements
Media
Nationalism
Political Movements (Nationalism, Communism, Anarchism)
Popular Culture (literature, film, music)
Post-1949 urban life
Post-1978 urban life
Public Health
Sports
Trans-local Communities
Transportation
Urbanization of Chinese society
Urban Administration
Urban life in Greater China (Hong Kong, Taiwan, Singapore)
Urban-Rural Relations
Wartime city life

#### SELECTED RESEARCH SOURCES

#### **ANTHOLOGIES**

Cheng, Pei-Kai and Michael Lestz with Jonathan Spence, eds., *The Search for Modern China: A Documentary Collection*, New York: Norton, 1999.

Davidson, Martha, A List of Published Translations from Chinese into English, French, and German. New Haven: Far Eastern Publications, 1957.

de Bary, William Theodore and Irene Bloom eds., *Sources of Chinese Tradition*, Vol 2. New York: Columbia University Press, 2000.

de Bary, William Theodore, Wing-tsit Chan, and Burton Watson. *Sources of Chinese Tradition*. 2 vols. New York: Columbia University Press, 1960.

Ebrey, Patricia, ed., *Chinese Civilization: A Sourcebook.* 2nd. Ed. New York: The Free Press, 1993.

Ebrey, Patricia et. al, eds., *A Visual Sourcebook of Chinese Civilization* <a href="http://depts.washington.edu/chinaciv/">http://depts.washington.edu/chinaciv/</a>

Halsall, Paul. *Internet East Asian History Sourcebook* http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/eastasia/eastasiasbook.html

Lau, Joseph and Howard Goldblatt, Eds. *Columbia Anthology of Modern Chinese Literature*. NY: CUP, 1994.

Mair, Victor, Ed. *The Columbia Anthology of Traditional Chinese Literature*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1994.

McDougall, Bonnie and Kam Louie. *The Literature of China in the Twentieth Century*. NY: Columbia University Press, 1997.

Stephen Owen, ed., trans. An Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to 1911. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1996.

#### RESEARCH GUIDES AND BIBLIOGRAPHIES

Chow, Tse-tsung, *Research Guide to the May Fourth Movement*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1963.

Elman, Benjamin A., *Classical Bibliography for Chinese History*, UCLA Social Science Computing Center, URL: <a href="http://www.princeton.edu/~classbib/">http://www.princeton.edu/~classbib/</a>.

Fairbank, John King and Kwang-ching Liu, *Modern China: A Bibliographical Guide to Chinese Works 1898-1937*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1950.

Fessler, Susanna and Anthony Deblasi, *East Asian Research and Bibliographic Methods*, University at Albany, Department of East Asian Studies, URL: <a href="http://www.albany.edu/eas/205/">http://www.albany.edu/eas/205/</a>.

Lecher, Hanno, *Internet Guide for Chinese Studies (IGCS)*, Institute of Chinese Studies, Heidelberg University, URL: <a href="http://sun.sino.uni-heidelberg.de/igcs/">http://sun.sino.uni-heidelberg.de/igcs/</a>.

Littrup, Leif, *Reference Works for Chinese Studies: An annotated bibliography and research guide*. University of Copenhagen, Department of History, URL: http://www.staff.hum.ku.dk/littrup/studmaterial/Reference%20Works/rwcs.htm.

Nathan, Andrew. *Modern China, 1840-1972: An Introduction to Sources and Research Aids.* Ann Arbor: U. Michigan Center for Chinese Studies, 1973.

Teng Ssu-yü Protest and Crime in China: A Bibliography of Secret Associations, Popular Uprisings, Peasant Rebellions New York: Garland Pub., 1981

Wilkinson, Endymion *Chinese History: A Manual*. Revised and enlarged (*Harvard-Yenching Institute Monograph Series* 52) Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press, 2000.

Zurndorfer, Harriet China Bibliography: A Research Guide to Reference Works about China Past and Present Leiden: Brill, 1995.

#### PERIODICALS AND MISSIONARY RECORDS

# **Guides:**

Britton, Roswell S., *The Chinese Periodical Press* 1800-1912 Taipei: Chi'ng-Wen Publishing Company, 1966.

King, Frank H., and Prescott Clarke, *A Research Guide to China-Coast Newspapers*, 1822-1911. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1965.

Archie R. Crouch, Scholar's Guide to China Mission Resources in the Libraries and Archives of the United States Armonk: M. E. Sharpe, 1989.

Tung, Julia. Hoover Institution on War, Revolution, and Peace. Bibliography of Chinese Government serials, 1880-1949: material in Hoover Institution on War, Revolution, and Peace Stanford: East Asian Collection, Hoover Institution, Stanford University, 1979.

Widor, Claude. *The Samizdat Press in China's Provinces, 1979-1981: An Annotated Guide.* Stanford: Hoover Institution, Stanford University, 1987.

**NOTE**: Here is a link to the draft of an insightful unpublished article on early 20th-century newspapers in Shanghai by Bryna Goodman (UO), titled "The Transnational (and Subnational) Worlds of Shanghai Newspaper Culture" You will find references in this article all of the newspapers we have on microfilm in the Jackson Library collection. I've included this article for its useful contextual information only. Click.

#### **Sources:**

China [microform] New York: Division of Foreign Missions, NCCCUSA, Far Eastern Joint Office, China Committee Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 278; 1850-1869.

China [microform] New York: Foreign Mission Conference of N.A., Far Eastern Joint Office, China Committee, [1947-1951] Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 278; Feb,1947-Dec. 1950.

China bulletin [microform] New York: Division of Foreign Missions, NCCCUSA, Far Eastern Joint Office, China Committee, [1951-1952] Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 278; OCT.

China bulletin of the Far Eastern Joint Office, Division of Foreign Missions, NCCC/USA [microform] New York: [The Office, 1952-1956] Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 278; Feb.1952-Dec 1956.

Chinese Communist affairs, facts & features. T'ai-pei, Institute of International Relations (LC # D839 .C455)

North China herald, and Supreme Court and consular gazette. Shanghai, H. Shearman. Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 588; 1870-1900.

North-China herald. Shanghai [etc.] *North-China Daily News & Herald*. Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 588; 1850-1869.

*People's daily online* [electronic resource]. Beijing: People's Daily Online, c2000- present. (WWW access from Library home page).

The China press (*Ta-lu pao*) (Shanghai, China) Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 5117; 1916-1924, 1949: Apr.1-May 26.

The Chinese recorder [microform]. Shanghai: American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1912-1938. Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 3963; v.70-72.

The Chinese recorder and educational review [microform]. Shanghai: Editorial Board, [1939-1941] Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 3963; v.43-69.

The Chinese recorder and missionary journal [microform]. Foochow: [s.n., 1868-1912] Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 3963; v.1-43, 19.

The Missionary recorder [microform]. Foochow: American M.E. Mission Press, 1867. Jackson Library Collection Microforms Film 3963; c.1, v.1, 1867

Xinhua News Agency news bulletin. Hong Kong: N.C.N. Ltd., 1985- present. (WWW access from Library home page).

# Appendix #1:

# RESEARCH ASSIGNMENT #1: PROJECT DESCRIPTION<sup>1</sup>

Due: Monday, September 22, in class

**Assignment:** On a sheet of paper, please type the following:

- 1. List your General Topic
- 2. Come up with a more specific Research Question (one sentence)
- 3. Write one (1) paragraph describing how you will answer this question
- 4. Append a list of one (1) primary and one (1) secondary source appropriate to your question. Remember: <u>all of these may well change in the next few weeks</u>, but I'd like to see you try to sketch out a project as soon as possible.

# **Explanation of the Assignment:**

# 1. General Topic:

Here I am asking for the research theme that first caught your eye. It is necessarily broad and descriptive.

#### 2. Research Question:

Every historian begins her/his research with a question. The question helps to determine what you hope to uncover about your general topic. Your topic may be the Boxer Rebellion, but, as your professor will probably say to you, "What <u>about</u> the Boxer Rebellion?" In other words, what are you hoping to find out about your topic? It is important to have a research question (or perhaps one or two questions) before starting to do your research, or else you won't know what to look for. Keep in mind, too, that it is <u>very</u> common for your question to change as you do research.

Keep in mind that there are several kinds of questions. The weakest questions require a description for their answer. Hence the question "What happened during the 1989 Tiananmen student demonstrations?" requires only that you find some texts about the students demonstrations and report back about them. In a way, such a question is more suited to journalism than it is to history. A second, more impressive question is one that requires analysis in answering it. This question, "What did the organizing tactics of Tiananmen demonstrators tell us about the prevalent political climate of Chinese society in 1989?" clearly requires you to do more than simply file a report. It requires you to think about the meaning of your topic to particular people in particular circumstances. This is the stuff of history.

Your research question is something that you should keep in the forefront of your mind for the entire semester. Constantly ask yourself "Why am I reading [whatevever source]? What am I looking for?" Your research question will guide your reading appropriately.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> A special word of thanks to Professor Rick Barton for his assistance with the description of these assignments.

#### 3. Brief Description of the Project:

Explain to me how you think you will pursue the research question you have just asked. You might discuss the kinds of sources you know (or hope) are available, and suggest some preliminary conclusions to your question. I only need a <u>short</u> paragraph here.

#### 4. A List of Two Sources:

Please provide the bibliographic information for one primary source and one secondary source that you feel will be relevant to your topic. Should you be at a loss for sources, you might consult the bibliographies in our course materials, or you can speak with me. If you are having trouble keeping primary and secondary sources straight, please refer to the Library of Congress's reference page (<a href="http://memory.loc.gov/ammem/ndlpedu/start/prim\_sources.html">http://memory.loc.gov/ammem/ndlpedu/start/prim\_sources.html</a>) for this topic. The University of Washington (my *alma mater*) Suzallo Library's web page "Using Primary Sources on the Web" (<a href="http://www.lib.washington.edu/subject/History/RUSA/">http://www.lib.washington.edu/subject/History/RUSA/</a>) is also a very useful resource, although the documents available for topics in Chinese history are somewhat more limited than is the case in other areas of history.

**A tip on formulating Research Questions:** [taken from Gregory G. Colomb et al., *Craft of Research*, p. 44]

It may help in formulating your Research Question to work through the following sequence of questions.

1. Name your topic:	
"I am studying [topic]	
2. Imply your question:	
'because I want to find out who/how/why	
3. State the rationale for the question and project:	
"in order to understand how/why	

#### Words of Wisdom: Make Use of Note cards

Make sure you are well stocked with note cards. Note cards are the researcher's best friends. I find it best to extrapolate a concept or topic from the quotation you are making note of and record it in the upper left corner. Try to be consistent in coming up with categories. In the upper right, you might note either the type of source (primary v. secondary), or something more specific (like the genre of the source). The point of a note card is not to copy down lots of information - that would be wasting your time. The point of a note card is to construct a reminder to yourself of sources that contain evidence relating to a particular topic/concept. Then when you sit down to write your paper, you can collect all your note cards and set them out before you; as you set out to write each section, you can pull all the note cards pertaining to the section at hand. It will save you lots of time flipping through books or large, unorganized notebooks.

# Appendix #2:

#### **RESEARCH ASSIGNMENT #2: PRELIMINARY BIBLIOGRAPHY**

#### DUE: Monday, October 13, in class

# Assignment:

- 1. Prepare a preliminary bibliography for your topic. This bibliography should include 8-12 items, divided into the following categories (arrange works alphabetically within each section):
- I. Primary Sources: I expect to see 1-3 listed.
- II. Secondary Sources
- A. Books (I expect 4-6)
- B. Articles (I expect 2-4)
- 2. Provide a short annotation with each bibliographic entry that includes a 1-2 sentence rationale for that source (i.e., why you think it'll be useful). You may place this comment immediately after the bibliographic entry.

#### **Reminders:**

- A. Remember that primary sources are those written during the period you are studying; secondary sources are analyses by modern writers.
- B. Books: often there will not be a book on your specific topic. Most scholars look for books to provide general or background information on the time period, region, or concept that interests them. You ought to be able to find books relatively easily by using any of the bibliographies listed on Bob Gaines's History 511 Web-page or my own web page.
- C. Articles: while it is generally harder for students to find articles than books, the reward is much greater. Articles, if well selected, often pertain more directly to the topic at hand and often provide much more specific interpretations against which you can shape your own argument. To find articles, use bibliographies and footnotes in books you have located, and/or the on-line databases, such as Expanded Academic Index, Web of Science, and JSTOR located on the library's Electronic Databases page.

# Appendix #3:

# RESEARCH ASSIGNMENT #3: CRITIQUE OF PEER'S PAPER

# DUE: Monday, November 24, in class

# **Assignment:**

Write a short (no more than 2 page) critique of your colleague's paper. Provide two (2) copies of that critique (one for your colleague, and one for me).

**Components of the Critique:** your critique should cover some or all of the following areas and/or questions.

- 1. **Thesis/Argument:** What is the argument of the paper? Is it clearly identified? Does the author maintain it throughout the paper? Does he/she successfully prove his/her point? How might the argument be strengthened?
- 2. **Historiography:** If appropriate, comment on how well the author situates his/her paper in the existing literature. That is, has the author examined the existing literature? How does his/her paper contribute to, modify, or reject the existing literature?
- 3. **Evidence:** Does the author possess sufficient evidence of sufficient quality to support his/her argument? Or does the evidence suggest something else? Does the author explain his/her evidence, or does he/she assume that you will see the importance of it? If the latter, how might he/she improve his/her discussion of the evidence?
- 4. **Structure:** Is the paper well organized? Could you follow the line of the argument? If not, how might the organization of the paper be improved? Remember that the ideal paper is like an assembly line, with each paragraph adding a bit more to the product until the conclusion, at which point you have a unified, coherent whole. Look for superfluous paragraphs and/or areas where expansion of the theme is necessary.
- 5. **Style:** Be careful and kind here. Everyone possesses an individual style. Still, you might well consider how the author's style helps and/or hinders the paper.
- 6. **Citations:** Does the author cite sources in a consistent way? Do the citations (either footnotes or endnotes) provide the needed support for the argument? That is, are they useful or are they peripheral to the argument?
- 7. **Grammar and Typos:** does the paper contain grammar errors and/or misspelled words? You only need comment on this if there is a serious problem (anyone can leave a few typos, but it's only worth commenting upon if they become so numerous as to detract from meaning).

