

## Assessment of Dissertation Defense

Name of Evaluator: \_\_\_\_\_

Name of Student Evaluated: \_\_\_\_\_ Semester/Year: \_\_\_\_\_

Dissertation advisors are encouraged to share and discuss these criteria with their mentees early in the process. Committee members should review the criteria upon receipt of the completed dissertation, prior to scheduling a defense, and use them as a guide in determining when to proceed to defense. Candidate should receive a minimum evaluation of “fair” in each category in order to pass. Each committee member’s agreement to proceed to defense implies that candidate has achieved a minimum evaluation of “fair” in each category related to the written dissertation.

This form is to be turned into the Director of Graduate Studies after the completion of the defense. Each committee member and the advisor should fill out a separate evaluation, and the candidate’s advisor should deliver all of them to the Director of Graduate Studies. Please gauge each student’s achievements in the following areas by circling the relevant rating. Note: this document will not be shown to the student.

- 1. Argument: Student is capable of making, and defending with evidence, an original argument that is clear and well-defined in scope and historiographical significance.**

Excellent                      Good                      Fair                      Poor                      Not at all

Comment: \_\_\_\_\_

- 2. Primary sources: Student has a sufficient evidentiary foundation of primary sources that are convincingly contextualized within the historical analysis.**

Excellent                      Good                      Fair                      Poor                      Not at all

Comment: \_\_\_\_\_

- 3. Secondary sources: Student has positioned their work within the relevant historiography and has established a sufficient range of secondary works with which to engage.**

Excellent                      Good                      Fair                      Poor                      Not at all

Comment: \_\_\_\_\_

- 4. Citations: Student has followed the proper format and established citation norms; bibliography is comprehensive and distinguishes between secondary and primary sources.**

Excellent                      Good                      Fair                      Poor                      Not at all

Comment: \_\_\_\_\_

- 5. Communication: Student can clearly express their ideas in both the written dissertation and the oral defense; writing is well-organized, compelling and engaging; quotations and paraphrasing from sources is done properly; grammar and spelling is impeccable.**

Excellent                      Good                      Fair                      Poor                      Not at all

Comment: \_\_\_\_\_